

4.5 Cultural Resources

Information contained in this section is summarized from the cultural resources report, *A Cultural and Historical Resources Study for the Grantville Redevelopment Study and Project Area*, prepared by ASM Affiliates, Inc. (ASM, 2004). This document is located in Volume II Appendix E of this EIR.

4.5.1 Existing Conditions

Records Search and Literature Review

A records search to identify cultural research studies previously completed and cultural sites recorded within the Project Area and within a one-mile radius of the Project Area was completed at the South Coastal Information Center, San Diego State University. The results of this records search indicates that a total of 55 cultural resource studies have been completed within a one-mile radius of the Project Area. The majority of these studies were corridor surveys for Caltrans expansion projects on Interstates 15 and 8. A number of historic building assessments have also been completed within a one-mile radius of the Project Area. The remaining projects were completed for private development. Most of the previous studies have not included the Grantville Redevelopment Project Area. The only projects that have overlapped with the Project Area are Cupples' survey along Mission Gorge Road (1974), the East Mission Gorge Trunk Sewer Project (Kyle and Gallegos, 1995a) and a survey for the Mission Valley Water Reclamation project (Carrico 1990). Native American consultation was also conducted as an additional source of information regarding traditional cultural properties, areas of cultural sensitivity or any other issues of concern regarding the project area.

Based on the records search, no historic or prehistoric resources have been recorded within the Grantville Project Area. However, prehistoric and historic sites (not including historic structures) have been recorded within one mile of the Project Area (Table 4.5-1). These previously recorded sites are located outside of the Project Area and are concentrated in Mission Valley and Mission Gorge. The most prominent among these is the Mission San Diego de Alcalá and the site of the ethnohistoric village of Nipaguay (CA-SDI-35/202), located on the west side of the San Diego river, across from the Grantville Project Area. Associated with this important site is the Mission dam and flume (CA-SDI-6660H). Other sites include: four prehistoric habitation sites (SDI-239, -11,723, -12,088, and -13,708); five lithic scatters (SDI-8667, -11,081, -11,613, -12,089, and -13,905); four historic trash scatters (SDI-35, -11,270, -13,923, and -14,017); three shell scatters (SDI-9899, -14,015, and -14,016); two prehistoric quarries (SDI-8349, -11,611); one bedrock milling site (SDI-11,077); one pictograph site, possibly of historic date, with lithic scatter (SDI-4505H); one artifact scatter (SDI-11,612); and one isolate (P-37-015082).

The Geofinder database has records for 102 historic buildings and structures within one mile of the Project Area. Twenty-seven buildings on the San Diego State University Campus (well outside of the Project Area) are listed on the National Register. The remaining buildings are concentrated in the Normal Heights and Kensington Heights communities. No historic buildings or structures are recorded within the Project Area.

TABLE 4.5-1
Previously Recorded Prehistoric and Historic Sites
Within One Mile of the Project Area

Site/Isolate #	Resource Description	Status
SDI-35/202	Mission San Diego de Alcalá/Kumeyaay village of Nipaguay	Significant
SDI-4505H	Pictographs and lithic scatter	Unknown
SDI-6660H	San Diego Mission dam and flume	Significant
SDI-8349	Prehistoric quarry	Unknown
SDI-8667	Sparse lithic scatter	Unknown
SDI-9899	Shell scatter and mutate	Unknown
SDI-11,077	Bedrock milling	Unknown
SDI-11,081	Lithic scatter	Not Significant
SDI-11,611	Prehistoric quarry	Unknown
SDI-11,612	Artifact scatter	Unknown
SDI-12,089	Lithic scatter	Unknown
SDI-13,905	Lithic scatter	Unknown
SDI-13,923	Historic trash dump	Not Significant
SDI-14,015	Shell scatter	Unknown
SDI-14,016	Shell scatter	Unknown
SDI-14,017	Historic trash scatter	Unknown
SDI-14,152	Heron site discovered under three meters of alluvial sands below water table on the banks of the lower San Diego River	Significant
P-37-015082	Isolate	Not Significant

Note: No previously recorded cultural resource sites have been identified within the Project Area.

Source: ASM Affiliates, Inc., 2004.

Historic Building Survey

ASM Affiliates, Inc. (ASM) reviewed SANGIS data regarding land parcels and building records within the Project Area. Buildings constructed prior to 1959 (45 years of age or older), meet the basic criterion for eligibility to the City Historical Resources Register. However, in order to allow for assessment of impacts to potentially eligible historic resources over the next five years, each of the buildings constructed prior to 1964 was visited during a field survey. Additionally, ASM conducted a street-by-street survey in an effort to identify other buildings constructed prior to 1964 for which construction dates are not available in the SANGIS data.

4.5.1.1 Archaeological Resources

The records search, literature review and Native American Consultation did not identify any previously recorded prehistoric or historic archaeological sites within the Project Area. However, a number of important sites are located in close proximity to the Project Area. These include the site of the ethnohistoric Kumeyaay village of *Nipaguay* and the Mission San Diego de Alcalá (CA-SDI-35/202), located on the west side of the San Diego River. Cultural resources sites associated with these historic properties, such as the Mission flume and dam, are known to be located along the San Diego River drainage. Because of the historical use of this area and the identification of previously recorded cultural resource sites, there remains

a high potential for previously undiscovered prehistoric and historic sites to be located along and adjacent to the San Diego River. For example, several previously unrecorded, but significant prehistoric sites have already been discovered, deeply buried in alluvium with the San Diego River Valley. These sites include the Heron site (SDI-14,152), discovered under three meters of alluvial sands below the water table on the banks of the lower San Diego River (ASM, 2004).

4.5.1.2 Historic Buildings and Structures

There are only 21 buildings located within the Project Area that have recorded construction dates prior to 1960: one from the 1910's, two from the 1930's, three from the 1940's and fifteen from the 1950's. An additional thirteen buildings of known or estimated date were recorded during the field survey conducted by ASM. In total, 28 buildings constructed prior to 1960, and an additional 13 buildings constructed between 1960 and 1964 were included in the inventory. Table 2 of the cultural resources report (see Volume II, Appendix E) provides a summary of buildings in the Project Area constructed prior to 1964; Table 3 summarizes buildings in the Project Area constructed prior to 1959; and, Table 4 summarizes buildings in the Project Area constructed between 1960 and 1964 (see Volume II, Appendix E). Of the 28 buildings dated to 1960 or earlier, recorded as a result of this study, almost all lack attributes that would qualify them for the City or State Register. Possible exceptions include 6980 Mission Gorge Road, 6974 Mission Gorge Road, 4385 Twain Avenue, and the Ascension Lutheran Church at 5106 Zion Avenue (Table 4.5-2).

TABLE 4.5-2
Potentially Historic Structures Located In Project Area

Structures	Resource Description	Status
6980 Mission Gorge Road	Constructed in 1930. <i>Ericson Pacific</i> . Warehouse/light industrial building, Concrete block construction with concrete foundation.	Unknown
6974 Mission Gorge Road	Constructed 1910. Residential unit. Side gabled wood framed house with a compound linear plan.	Unknown
4385 Twain Avenue	Constructed 1930. Small wood and stucco bungalow.	Unknown
5106 Zion Avenue	Ascension Lutheran Church	Unknown

Note: No previously recorded cultural resource sites have been identified within the Project Area.

Source: ASM Affiliates, Inc., 2004.

4.5.2 Impact Threshold

For purposes of this EIR a significant impact will occur if the proposed project would:

- *Cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource as defined in Section 15064.5 of the CEQA Guidelines.*
- *Cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an archaeological resource pursuant to Section 15064.5 of the CEQA Guidelines.*
- *Disturb any human remains, including those interred outside of formal cemeteries.*

4.5.3 Impact

4.5.3.1 *Archeological Resources*

There are no previously recorded archaeological sites located within the Project Area. However, there is a high potential for subsurface prehistoric and Spanish Colonial period archaeological sites to be located within the alluvial plain of the San Diego River. This would apply to those portions of the Project Area located west of Fairmont Avenue, and the undeveloped areas located north of Friars Road and north of Mission Gorge Road. Future redevelopment activities within these portions of the Project Area have the potential to result in a significant impact to previously unrecorded archaeological resources. A site-specific cultural resources survey would be required in order to identify presence or absence of cultural resources. Additionally, archaeological monitoring would be required within these areas during site development. Any newly discovered sites would need to be tested to determine significance, and site-specific impacts mitigated through avoidance and preservation, or completion of a data recovery program. Implementation of Mitigation Measure CR1 would reduce this potential impact to archaeological resources to a level less than significant.

4.5.3.2 *Historic Buildings and Structures*

Buildings greater than 45 years in age are potentially eligible to the City of San Diego Historic resources Register. Specifically, within the City of San Diego, properties that are 45 years old or greater and which have "integrity of setting, location, design, materials, feeling and association" may qualify for inclusion in the City's Historical Resources Register (City of San Diego 2000:10). There are no previously recorded buildings or structures within the Project Area and there are no historical properties listed on the City, State, or Federal registers within the Project Area. Of the 28 buildings dated to 1960 or earlier, recorded as a result of ASM's study, almost all lack attributes that would qualify the structures for the City or State Register. Possible exceptions include 6980 Mission Gorge Road, 6974 Mission Gorge Road, 4385 Twain Avenue, and the Ascension Lutheran Church at 5106 Zion Avenue. The following provides a description of each of these structures:

6974 Mission Gorge Road. This warehouse/light industrial building was constructed in 1930. It consists of a concrete block construction with concrete foundation. The front gable has a centrally placed opening and stepped false front. Two small wide wood framed windows are located high on the gable end and red brick inlaid in the gable forms an arrow shape.

6980 Mission Gorge Road. This side gabled wood frame house was constructed in 1910. The building consists of a one and one-half story building with a single story extension and an attached garage to the east. There is also a detached garage to the west. The roof is wooden shingles.

4385 Twain Avenue. This small wood and stucco bungalow was constructed in 1930. The front façade has a centrally placed door with picture windows on either side. There is a small front porch with shed roof supported on plain posts.

5106 Zion Avenue (Ascension Lutheran Church). The Ascension Lutheran Church was built between 1957 and 1960 and was designed by Des Lauriers & Sigurson, Architects. The structure was originally located to the rear of the Baptist church on Greenbrier Street and was moved to its present location in 1960 (the structure was designed to be moveable). The church has a dramatic, steeply pitched roof extending almost to the ground.

Formal evaluation to the City and State registers is specifically recommended for these buildings if any future redevelopment activities are anticipated to result in an impact to these structures. There are thirteen additional buildings dating between 1960 and 1965 that will reach the 45-year age threshold for potential eligibility to the City register over the next few years. However, none of these buildings appear eligible to the State or City register. The redevelopment plan will have a lifespan of 30-years. It is possible that future redevelopment activities would result in an impact to structures that are currently not considered historic, but would meet the age eligibility criteria in the future (e.g. 10-15 years in the future). As such, future redevelopment activities have the potential result in a significant impact to historic structures. Implementation of Mitigation Measure CR2 will reduce potential impact to historic buildings and structures to a level less than significant.

4.5.4 Significance of Impact

Implementation of future redevelopment activities has the potential to result in an impact to previously unrecorded cultural resources sites (archaeological and historical) as well as potentially significant historic structures. This potential impact is considered significant.

4.5.5 Mitigation Measures

4.5.5.1 *Historic Resources*

CR1 The following measures shall be implemented prior to proceeding with any redevelopment activities in the Project Area:

- 1) Any areas proposed for development that have not previously been surveyed for cultural resources within the last five years shall be surveyed to identify presence/absence of cultural resources.
- 2) Any proposed development which may disturb subsurface soils, including removal of existing buildings or construction activities located adjacent to the San Diego River, shall include archaeological monitoring.
- 3) All potential prehistoric sites located within the San Diego River alluvial plain that will be impacted by proposed development shall be tested under City of San Diego and CEQA Guidelines to determine significance. Testing through subsurface excavation provides the necessary information to determine site boundary, depth, content, integrity, and potential to address important research questions.

- 4) Alternative options for significant sites under City of San Diego and CEQA Guidelines can include: 1) avoidance, and preservation, or 2) mitigation of impacts from proposed development through completion of a data recovery program in compliance with CEQA Guidelines.

CR2 The following procedures shall be implemented before any Redevelopment Project activities can occur in the Redevelopment Project Area:

- 1) Conduct a historical resource survey of properties located within the Project Area that are 45 years of age and older resulting in a report with determinations of potential eligibility of said properties to the California Register of Historic Places and the City of San Diego Historic Resources List.
- 2) Obtain a concurrence on these determinations from the State Office of Historic Preservation and City Historical Resources Board.
- 3) If any potential historical resources are identified and are found to be eligible, identify potential impacts from the proposed redevelopment project actions, and determine appropriate mitigations as defined in CEQA Guideline Section 15064.5 to reduce such impact to a level below significance.

4.5.6 Conclusion

Implementation of the proposed Redevelopment Project has the potential to impact previously unrecorded, significant prehistoric and historic archaeological resources as a result of future development within the Project Area. Implementation of Mitigation Measure CR1 will reduce the impact to a level less than significant.

Implementation of the proposed Redevelopment Project has the potential to impact significant historical buildings and structures. Implementation of Mitigation Measure CR2 will reduce the impact to a level less than significant.